



Conservation of Cultural Built Heritage

An Investigation of Stakeholder Perceptions in Australia and Tanzania

Johari Hussein Nassor Amar

Submitted in total fulfilment of the requirements of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

Faculty of Society & Design

Bond University

Gold Coast, Queensland

Australia

August 2017

Abstract

Cultural built heritage reflects people's identity in a continuum of space and time and, in today's complex societies, has become a landscape where different multicultural communities are tangibly negotiating significant historical narratives and meanings to enhance their surrounding built environment. To ensure that the cultural values attached to the authenticity and integrity of a built form are retained for future generations, approaches such as protection, preservation, rehabilitation and reconstruction are employed. These approaches are represented by a single concept, 'conservation'. The theory, policy and practice of the conservation of cultural built heritage have been practised for many centuries. For instance, in Australia as in Tanzania, the historical development of heritage conservation indicates a shift from traditional custodianship during the pre-historic time to Western-style management during colonial times and, more recently, to sustainable conservation. In both Australia and Tanzania, the heritage conservation process is constantly being transformed with the aim of developing appropriate decision-making systems for retaining significant buildings, monuments and sites within a dynamic cultural landscape.

Despite the importance of the conservation of cultural built heritage, this thesis has identified that the management of cultural built heritage remains problematic, even with the existence of legislative frameworks, guidelines, charters and policies for conservation at the local, national and international levels. To some, the problem is related to the conservation of cultural built heritage being instrumental in the changing narratives and memories that form significant values. For others, the problem is related to the nature of the conservation processes in respect of the authenticity and integrity of cultural built heritage in dynamic communities. These problems exist partly because the conservation of cultural built heritage is interdisciplinary; that is, the heritage industry comprises three stakeholder groups: the public sector (policymakers and decision-makers); the private sector (e.g. owners, developers and investors), who are also decision-makers; and the general community (e.g. professional organisations, volunteers, academic institutions, non-governmental organisations and the media). To varying degrees, the three groups of stakeholders share a common understanding of heritage conservation but have diverse perceptions, interests and expectations which influence the decisions they make concerning their involvement with the management of cultural built heritage. This indicates that there is a reasonably fragmented understanding

regarding the interdisciplinary context of conservation of cultural built heritage.

Thus, this thesis sets out to address the question of what drives the conservation of cultural built heritage, with a specific focus on exploring the diversity of stakeholders' perceptions of the issues motivating the process of conservation decision-making and factors that act as barriers to the management of cultural built heritage. Four focus groups (n=26) were conducted in Australia and Tanzania (two case studies in each country) with an addition of two interviews in Tanzania involving key informants from different professional heritage backgrounds. An initial empirical analysis and interpretation of the qualitative data produced a number of findings which led to (i) the development of a framework for a conservation decision-making process illustrating a logical flow for an effective and efficient sustainable management system of cultural built heritage and (ii) the introduction of a new analytical concept entitled 'community heritage discourse (CHD)' that could help address different stakeholders' interests and perceptions through a conservation co-creation process directed towards safeguarding cultural built heritage for future generations in Australia, Tanzania and other present day societies. In turn, the improved understanding and contribution presented in the thesis are intended to help resolve management issues and challenges as well as enhance sustainability in the conservation of cultural built heritage.

Declaration

This thesis is submitted to Bond University in fulfilment of the requirements of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy. This thesis represents my own original work towards this research degree and contains no material which has been previously submitted for a degree or diploma at this University or any other institution, except where due acknowledgement is made.



Johari Hussein Nassor Amar

Date

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank many people who have helped me through to the completion of this thesis. First and foremost, I sincerely appreciate the thoughtful advice, constructive criticism and encouragement that Associate Professors Lynne Armitage and Daniel O'Hare have offered me as my dissertation supervisors. Their unconditional support and guidance have contributed to the successful completion of this thesis. On a more personal note, I would like to thank Lynne for being incredibly compassionate and for the emotional and motivational support when I needed it the most. Thank you for never giving up on me. I would like to express my sincere gratitude to Bond University for the higher degree study scholarship that assisted with the immersion into lengthy days of research and for the 24-hour access to the print room and research facilities. A special thanks to Dr Linda Too for the initial supervision during my preparation for the conformation of candidature and to Belinda Glyn for proofreading and editing my thesis.

Furthermore, my deep appreciation goes out to my own informal 'research team': Assistant Professor Scott Cooper, Professor John Sheehan, Paul Van Der Kallen and Dr Richard Sambaiga. I also extend my gratitude to all focus groups and interview respondents from New South Wales, Queensland, Dar es Salaam and Zanzibar, all of whom have freely given their time and knowledge to participate in this research. This doctoral thesis would not have been possible without their shared knowledge, experiences and insights about the subject matter. I trust that the findings will be of benefit to the disciplines involved in the conservation of cultural built heritage. Finally, the above-acknowledged persons are in no way responsible for any errors, misrepresentations, omissions and unfair opinions or arguments that may appear in this report. I hold myself solely responsible for any such presentations.

This work is highly dedicated to my beloved parents Ashura Kingi Mhoja and Hussein Nassor Amar and my siblings Kassam, Fatma, Zakia, Nassor and Amina and their families. I will always be indebted to the endless overwhelming love and support they have provided. My sincere thanks to my 'PhD family,' Kelly Jenkins, Melanie Witthoft, Danny Va, Deb Smith, Rosemarie Rusch and Burhan Amarah, for all the great food and for their suggestions, relentless encouragement and distractions during the challenging times of my mental blocks. To the entire staff in the School of Sustainable Development, I say thank you for all the great ideas you have shared during our morning teas.

Contents

Abstract.....	i
Declaration.....	iii
Acknowledgements.....	iv
Contents	v
List of Figures.....	x
List of Tables	xii
List of Abbreviations	xiii
List of Legislation.....	xvi
List of Publications	xviii
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Background and justification	2
1.2 Problem statement and research question	5
1.3 Research aim and objectives	10
1.4 Research approach.....	10
1.6 Thesis outline	12
CHAPTER 2: THE CONTEXT OF CONSERVATION OF CULTURAL BUILT HERITAGE - A REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE	15
2.1 Introduction	15
2.2 The context of cultural built heritage	15
2.2.1 Culture and heritage.....	15
2.2.2 The meaning of cultural built heritage	17
2.2.3 Aspects of cultural built heritage.....	19
2.3 The conservation of cultural built heritage	24
2.3.1 Definition and principles of heritage conservation.....	24
2.3.2 Decision-making for the conservation process.....	27

2.3.3 International conservation charters and documents.....	30
2.4 An overview of stakeholders.....	34
2.4.1 Stakeholder issues in conservation of cultural built heritage	36
2.4.2 The identification of stakeholder groups	38
2.4.3 Framing the concept of perception	42
2.5 Stakeholders, perception and built heritage conservation.....	44
2.6 Conclusion.....	47
CHAPTER 3: RESEARCH DESIGN.....	48
3.1 Introduction	48
3.2 Research paradigm	48
3.3 Research method	52
3.4 Research strategy.....	54
3.4.1 Case study selection.....	55
3.4.2 Unit of analysis.....	58
3.5 Data collection methods	59
3.5.1 Literature review.....	60
3.5.2 Focus group	61
3.5.3 Follow-up interviews	64
3.5.4 Characteristic of participants	66
3.6 Data analysis	67
3.7 Reliability and validity	68
3.8 Research ethical issues	70
3.9 Conclusion.....	71
CHAPTER 4: CONSERVATION OF AUSTRALIAN CULTURAL BUILT HERITAGE ..	72
4.1 Introduction	72
4.2 National overview and background.....	72
4.2.1 Evolution of the Indigenous cultural landscape	74
4.2.2 Development of Australian cultural built heritage	78
4.3 Heritage conservation movements	87

4.3.1 Conservation movements in the early 20 th century	88
4.3.2 Heritage conservation and planning in the post-world war era	89
4.3.3 The emergence of modern conservation management	92
4.4 Regulatory framework for the conservation of cultural built heritage	96
4.4.1 Commonwealth (national) heritage legislation.....	96
4.4.2 State and territory heritage legislation.....	99
4.4.3 Local heritage conservation laws	106
4.5 Stakeholders in the Australian heritage sector	107
4.5.1 The government of Australia	109
4.5.2 The Australian private property owners	110
4.5.3 The Australian cultural heritage experts.....	111
4.5.4 The Australian heritage tourism operators	112
4.5.5 The Australian general community	113
4.6 Conclusion: Key issues in Australian built heritage conservation.....	114

CHAPTER 5: CONSERVATION OF CULTURAL BUILT HERITAGE IN THE UNITED REPUBLIC OF TANZANIA	116
5.1 Introduction	116
5.2. National overview and background.....	117
5.2.1 Evolution of the Indigenous cultural landscape	118
5.2.2 Development of Tanzanian cultural built heritage	122
5.3 Heritage conservation movements	134
5.3.1 Pre-colonial traditional management system.....	135
5.3.2 Colonial heritage management system	137
5.3.3 Post-independence conservation management system	139
5.4. Regulatory framework for the conservation of cultural built heritage.....	144
5.4.1 The Cultural Policy of the United Republic of Tanzania 1997	145
5.4.2 The Antiquities Act of 1964 - Tanzanian mainland	146
5.4.3 The Ancient Monument Preservation Decree of 1927 - Zanzibar.....	149
5.4.4 Other legislation for built heritage conservation	151
5.5 Stakeholders in the Tanzanian heritage sector	156
5.5.1 The government of Tanzania	156

5.5.2 The Tanzanian private property owners	157
5.5.3 The Tanzania cultural heritage experts.....	159
5.5.4 The Tanzanian tourism operators	160
5.5.5 The Tanzanian general community	161
5.6 Conclusion: Key issues in Tanzania’s built heritage conservation	161
CHAPTER 6: EMPIRICAL ANALYSIS, INTERPRETATION AND FINDINGS OF FOCUS GROUPS AND IN-DEPTH INTERVIEWS	163
6.1 Introduction	163
6.2 Common themes arising from the qualitative data analysis.....	163
6.2.1 Definition of cultural built heritage	164
6.2.2 Specific aspects of cultural built heritage.....	167
6.2.3 Motivation for conserving cultural built heritage.....	173
6.2.4 Barriers related to conservation of cultural built heritage	181
6.2.5 Priorities for the conservation of cultural built heritage.....	200
6.2.6 Future planning approaches to address perceptions of heritage stakeholders	204
6.3 Decision-making framework for the conservation of cultural built heritage	209
6.4 Conclusion.....	214
CHAPTER 7: DISCUSSION AND GENERAL CONCLUSION	215
7.1 Introduction	215
7.2 Discussion	215
7.2.1 Summary of the empirical analysis, interpretation and findings	216
7.2.2 Theoretical implications	222
7.2.3 Policy implications	224
7.2.4 Practical implications	227
7.2.5 Revised conceptual and theoretical framework.....	231
7.3 Evaluating the conclusions against the research objectives	234
7.3.1 Overview of cultural built heritage conservation	235
7.3.2 The conservation movement and current practice	235
7.3.3 Stakeholders in the conservation of cultural built heritage	236

7.3.4 What drives the conservation process of cultural built heritage?	237
7.3.5 Contribution and recommendations to the heritage sector	238
7.4 Limitations	243
7.5 Future directions for research.....	244
7.5.1 The impact of multiculturalism on built heritage management.....	245
7.5.2 Conservation of cultural built heritage: A stakeholder analysis	245
7.5.3 Cluster analysis of perceived conservation barriers and motivators	246
7.6 Conclusion.....	247
 BIBLIOGRAPHY	 249
 APPENDICES	 283
Appendix A Focus group and interview questionnaire	283
Appendix B Research instrument.....	285
Appendix C Research protocol	288
Appendix D Heritage expert resigns due to political interference	291

List of Figures

Figure 1.1	Research approach.....	11
Figure 2.1	A chronology of the values of cultural built heritage.....	22
Figure 2.2	Principles and guidelines of the heritage conservation process.....	26
Figure 2.3	Stakeholders in the heritage sector.....	39
Figure 2.4	Conceptual and theoretical frameworks.....	46
Figure 3.1	Research approach and strategy.....	53
Figure 3.2	Zanzibar slave chambers.....	56
Figure 3.3	Summary of research design.....	59
Figure 4.1	Map of Australian states and territories.....	73
Figure 4.2	Socio-spatial patterns on the Indigenous cultural landscape.....	77
Figure 4.3	Examples of first settlement structures in Australia.....	79
Figure 4.4	Australian colonial and state boundaries between 1825 and 1911.....	80
Figure 4.5	Early constructions and development project in Australia.....	81
Figure 4.6	Architectural styles of Australian federation and inter-war housing	83
Figure 4.7	Chinese, Japanese and Jewish architectural influences in Australia.....	86
Figure 5.1	Administrative boundaries of the United Republic of Tanzania.....	118
Figure 5.2	Maasai traditional architecture in Tanzania.....	121
Figure 5.3	Artistic reconstruction of Husuni Kubwa ruins in Kilwa.....	123
Figure 5.4	Zanzibar Portuguese fortress in 1598 and 1612.....	124
Figure 5.5	Map showing slave and ivory centres Tanganyika inlands.....	125
Figure 5.6	Large stone buildings in Zanzibar	125
Figure 5.7	A Gujarat haveli house and the famous wooden doors in Tanzania.....	127
Figure 5.8	The House of Wonders Built in 1880s	128
Figure 5.9	Built environment in Sultan Barghash’s reign between 1870 and 1890.....	129
Figure 5.10	A colonial European-style bungalow in Tanzania Zone A and Zone III.....	131
Figure 5.11	Air view of Zone B and Zone II of Zanzibar and Tanganyika	132
Figure 5.12	The evolution of the Tanzanian Swahili house.....	133
Figure 5.13	Dar es Salaam city centre in 1930 and 2006.....	158
Figure 6.1	Combined stakeholders’ motivations for built heritage conservation.....	181
Figure 6.2	Barriers to conservation of cultural built heritage.....	199

Figure 6.3	Priorities for conservation of cultural built heritage.....	200
Figure 6.4	An iterative sequence for effective conservation of cultural built heritage.....	213
Figure 7.1	Initial conceptual and theoretical frameworks.....	232
Figure 7.2	Revised conceptual and theoretical framework.....	233
Figure 7.3	An iterative sequence for effective conservation of cultural built heritage.....	241

List of Tables

Table 3.1	Research paradigm and philosophy	50
Table 3.2	Focus groups fieldwork locations and participants' background.....	63
Table 3.3	Summary of interview participants' background.....	65
Table 4.1	Sustainable development in built heritage conservation.....	94
Table 4.2	SWOT analysis for the EPBC Act 1999.....	98
Table 4.3	Comparison of state and territory heritage acts.....	105
Table 4.4	Local heritage conservation legislation.....	108
Table 5.1	Summary of master plans in the Tanzanian mainland.....	153
Table 5.2	Summary of master plans in Zanzibar.....	155
Table 6.1	Common themes of the focus groups and in-depth interviews	164
Table 6.2	Summary of quotes for the definition of cultural built heritage.....	165
Table 6.3	Summary of quotes relating to significant values of cultural built heritage.....	168
Table 6.4	Summary of authenticity and integrity of the cultural built heritage	171

List of Abbreviations

AACAI	Australia Association of Consulting Archaeologists Inc.
AAT	Architect Association of Tanzania
ABS	Australian Bureau of Statistics
ACET	Association of Consulting Engineers Tanzania
ACF	Australian Conservation Foundation
ACPHA	Australian Council of Professional Historians Associations
AIA	Australian Institute of Architect
AICCM	Australian Institute for Conservation of Cultural Materials
AILA	Australian Institute of Landscape Architects
AKTC	Aga Khan Trust for Culture (Tanzania)
BLF	Builders Labourers Federation (Australia)
BOMA	British Overseas Management Administration (Tanzania)
BUHREC	Bond University Human Research Ethics Committee
CFMEU	Construction, Forestry, Mining and Energy Unit (Australia)
CHD	Community Heritage Discourse
COAG	Council of Australian Governments
COSTECH	Tanzania Commission for Science and Technology
DEHP	Department of Environment and Heritage Protection (Queensland)
DFAT	Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade (Australia)
DIRD	Department of Infrastructure and Regional Development (Australia)
DRET	Department of Resources, Energy and Tourism (Australian)
DSEWPC	Department of Sustainability, Environment, Water, Population and Communities (Australia)
DURP	Department of Urban and Rural Planning (Zanzibar)
ECA	Environmental Consultant Association (Australia)
ESD	Ecologically Sustainable Development
FINNIDA	Finnish International Development Agency
GBCA	Green Building Council of Australia
HAT	Historical Association of Tanzania
HEART	Heritage Emergency Action Team (Australia)

	International Centre for the Study of the Preservation and Restoration of Cultural Property
ICCROM	Cultural Property
ICOMOS	International Council on Monuments and Sites
KFT	Knight Frank Tanzania
LEPs	Local Environmental Plans (Australia)
MLHHS	Ministry of Lands, Housing and Human Settlements Development (Tanzania)
MNRT	Ministry of Natural Resources and Tourism (Tanzania)
NCHF	National Cultural Heritage Forum (Australia)
NFA	National Fund for Antiquities (Tanzania)
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
NHC	National Housing Corporation (Tanzania)
NHF	National Heritage Foundation (Australia)
NITV	National Indigenous Television (Australia)
NORAD	Norwegian Agency for Development Cooperation
PPCP	Public/Private Community Partnership
QHC	Queensland Heritage Council
RGA	Resident Group Actions (Australia)
RHSD	Royal Historical Society of Queensland
RNE	Register of National Estate (Australia)
STCDA	Stone Town Conservation Development Authority (Zanzibar)
SUZA	State University of Zanzibar
SWOT	Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities and Threats
TAAP	Tanzania Association of Archaeologists and Paleoanthropologists
TAEE	Tanzania Association of Environmental Engineers
TANU	Tanzania African National Union
TBC	Tanzania Broadcasting Corporation
TCTF	Tanzania Culture Trust Fund
TIVEA	Tanzania Institute of Valuers and Estates Agents
TNBS	Tanzania National Bureau of Statistics
TTB	Tanzania Tourist Board
TVZ	Television Zanzibar
UDSM	University of Dar es Salaam

UNCHS	United Nations Commission on Human Settlements
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
UQCHC	University of Queensland Cultural and Heritage Unit
VSER	Victorian State of the Environment Report
WALGA	Western Australian Local Government Association
WHL	World Heritage List
WTC	Waqf and Trust Centre (Zanzibar)
ZSTHC	Zanzibar Stone Town Heritage Society

List of Legislation

The Antiquities (Amendment) Act of 1979 - Tanzania mainland
The Antiquities Act of 1964 - Tanzania mainland
The Australian Heritage Council (Transitional and Consequential Provision) Act 2003
The Australian Capital Territory Heritage Act 2004 - ACTH Act
The Australian Capital Territory Heritage Legislation (Amendment) Act 2014
The Australian Capital Territory Land (Planning and Environment) Act 1991 – LPE Act
The Australian Heritage Commission Act 1975
The Australian Heritage Council Act 2003 - AHC Act
The Commonwealth of Australia Constitution Act 1901 - CAC Act
The Cultural Policy of the United Republic of Tanzania 1997
The Endangered Species Protection Act 1992 – Australian Government
The Environmental Protection (Impact of Proposal) Act 1974 – Australian Government
The Environmental Protection and Biodiversity Conservation Act 1999 - EPBC Act
The German Build Ordinance of 1891 – Tanzania mainland
The German Building Ordinance (Amendment) Ordinance 1914 – Tanzania Mainland
The Heritage and Planning Legislation Amendment Bill 2010 - HPLAB
The Heritage of Western Australia Act 1990 - HWA Act
The Historic Shipwreck Act 1976 – Australian Government
The Land Act 1999 - Tanzania mainland
The Land Tenure Act of 1992 - Zanzibar
The National Antiquities Policy of 2008 - NAP 2008
The National Parks and Wildlife Conservation Act 1975 – Australian Government
The New South Wales Environmental Planning Assessment Act 1979 – NSW EPA Act
The New South Wales Heritage Act 1977 - NSWH Act
The New South Wales Heritage Amendment Act 2009 – NSWHA Act 2009
The Northern Territory Heritage Conservation Act 2011 - NTHC Act
The Queensland Heritage Act 1992 - QH Act
The Queensland Heritage Building Protection Act 1990 – QHBP Act 1990
The Queensland Sustainable Planning Act 2009 – QSP Act
The South Australia Heritage Act 1993 - SAH Act

The South Australian Development Act 1993 – SAD Act 1993
The South Australian Heritage Act 1978 – SAH Act 1978
The Tanganyika Monument Preservation (Amendment) Ordinance 1949
The Tanganyika Monument Preservation Ordinance 1937
The Tanganyika Town and Country Planning Ordinance 1956 - TCPO 1956
The Tanganyika Act of Parliament No. 45 1962
The Tasmanian Historic Cultural Heritage Act 1995 - THCH Act
The Tasmanian Historic Cultural Heritage Amendment Act 2013 – HCHA Act
The Tasmanian Land Use Planning and Approval Act 1993 – TLUPA Act
The Town and Country Planning 1932 - British
The Town and Country Planning Act 1947 - British
The United Republic of Tanzania Cultural Heritage Policy of 2008
The Victoria Archaeology and Aboriginal Relics Preservation Act 1972 – AARP Act
The Victoria Historic Building Preservation Act 1974
The Victoria Heritage Act 1995- VH Act
The Victoria Historic Building Act 1981 – HB Act
The Victoria Historic Shipwrecks Act 1981 – HS Act
The Victoria Planning and Environmental Act 1987 – VPE Act
The World Heritage Properties Conservation Act 1983 - WHPC Act
The Western Australian Town Planning and Development Act 2005 – WATPD Act
The Western Australian Heritage and Planning Legislation Amendment Act 2001 - HPLA Act
The Whale Protection Act 1980 – Australian Government
The Zanzibar Ancient Monuments Preservation Decree of 1927 - AMDPD 1927
The Zanzibar Land Acquisition Decree of 1909
The Zanzibar Presidential Decree of 1965
The Zanzibar Town and Country Planning (Amendment) Decree 1960
The Zanzibar Town and Country Planning Decree of 1955 - ZTCPO 1955

List of Publications

Peer reviewed publications arising from this thesis:

Book Chapter

Amar, J.H.N. and Armitage, L. (forthcoming). The role of offsets in the conservation of cultural built heritage: the case of Tanzania's post-independence reform policies. The Commonwealth Scientific and Industrial Research Organisation (CSIRO), Australia.

Journal Articles

Amar, J.H.N. and Armitage, L. (in press). The impact of stakeholders on the conservation of cultural built heritage in Tanzania. *Heritage & Society*.

Amar, J.H.N., Armitage, L. and O'Hare, D. (2017). Australian cultural built heritage: Stakeholders' perceived conservation barriers and motivations. *The Journal Pacific Rim Property Research Journal*, 23 (2), 161-173.

Conference Papers

Amar, J.H.N., Armitage, L. and O'Hare, D. (2016). Built heritage conservation: The implications of cultural racism, segregation and oppression. In Amoêda, R. Lira, S. and Pinheiro, C. (Eds.). *Heritage 2016 - Proceedings of the 5th International Conference on Heritage and Sustainable Development* (pp. 225-236). Lisbon: Green Line Institute. ISBN 978-989-8734-15-0.

Amar, J.H.N., Armitage, L. and O'Hare, D. (2016). Australian cultural built heritage: Stakeholders' perceived conservation barriers and motivations. *Proceedings from the 22nd Annual Pacific-Rim Real Estate Society Conference*, 17-20 January, Sunshine Coast, Queensland, Australia

Hussein, J. and Armitage, L. (2014). Traditional Heritage Management: The Case of Australia and Tanzania. *Proceedings from the 19th Annual Asian Real Estates Society Conference*, 14-16 July, Gold Coast, Australia.

Hussein, J., Armitage, L. and Too, L. (2014). An historical perspective of the evolution of Australian built heritage and its management. *Proceedings from the 20th Annual Pacific-Rim Real Estate Society Conference*, 19-22 January, Christchurch, New Zealand.