

A Critical Analysis of the Teaching of Hospitality at
Marymount College

G. Y. Jenkins

Bond University

Gold Coast

Australia

SEPTEMBER 2005

ABSTRACT

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION	9
1.1 Growth of vocational education in schools.....	9
1.2 The need for effective reflective practices in vocational education	10
1.3 Background to the project	10
CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW	12
2.1 The premise of education and learning.....	12
2.2 Providing expanded pathways for high school students	12
2.3 Changing educational expectations	13
2.4 Workplace learning in the school	13
2.5 Historical background of vocational education – International Perspective	14
2.5.1 Overview of the origins of teaching workplace skills in formal education.....	14
2.5.2 Economic Rationalism and its relationship with education.....	14
2.5.3 Internationally-recognised vocational models of learning.....	16
2.5.4 The development of Competency-Based Education and Training in America	16
2.5.5 Researchers accredited with the foundations for Competency-Based Education and Training.....	17
2.5.6 Competency-Based Education and Training today in America currently.....	18
2.5.7 Assessment in Competency-Based Education and Training	18
2.5.8 Features of Competency-Based Education and Training.....	19
2.5.9 Ascertaining competency.....	19
2.5.10 Characteristics of the American model of vocational training	20
2.5.11 Critics of the American model.....	20
2.5.12 The Great Britain model of vocational training	21
2.5.13 The third model of vocational training – The Nordic Model	21
2.5.14 Outlier models of vocational training	22
2.5.15 The relevance of the German and Japanese models of vocational training	23
2.6 The development of Vocational Education in Australia	24
2.6.1 The beginnings of the Vocational Training movement in Australia.....	24
2.6.2 Education in Queensland	25
2.6.3 Vocational education in Queensland prior to 1890	25
2.6.4 The beginnings of formalised vocational education in Queensland.....	26
2.6.5 The beginnings of a national vocational education scheme – The Kangan Report	28
2.6.6 The development of secondary education in Queensland.....	28
2.6.7 The merging of secondary education and vocational education at a national level.....	29
2.6.8 Significant reports influencing the national vocational education agenda	30
2.6.9 The introduction of Competency Based Education and Training into Australian vocational training.....	31
2.7 National Competency Standards for Vocational Education	32

2.8 Changes to vocational training during the 1990s	32
2.9 The Generic Key Competencies	33
2.9.1 The Australian Generic Key competencies as identified by the Mayer report.....	34
2.9.2 The development of the Generic Key Competency skills at a school level.....	36
2.10 The national focus for vocational training.....	38
2.11 The development of Training packages and implications on school	41
2.12 Identifying competency in the Training Packages	43
2.13 The development of a learning culture: The Australian Recognition Framework (ARF) and the New Apprenticeship System	43
2.14 The Common and Agreed National Goals for Schooling in the Twenty-first Century (The Adelaide Declaration)	44
2.15 The changing perception of vocational education	47
2.16 The growth of Vocational Education and Training in schools	48
2.17 The changing focus of the school curriculum	48
2.18 The advantages of incorporating VET into the school program	49
2.19 The issues associated with the growth of vocational education in schools	49
2.19.1 School programming, timetabling and staffing.....	50
2.19.2 The responses of students to workload demands	50
2.19.3 The effect on all teachers.....	51
2.19.4 The pedagogy of Competency-Based Education and Training.....	53
2.19.5 Changes to assessment methods	55
2.19.6 Industry acceptance and perception of school delivered vocational competency.....	56
2.20 Current implications of vocational education in schools	56
2.21 Local Policy considerations - Queensland Studies Authority Guidelines	57
2.21.1 The need to ensure more young people achieve higher qualifications.....	58
2.21.2 Queensland's response to this need.....	58
2.21.3 Current changes required in Queensland schools	60
2.21.4 Essential considerations associated with the implementation of the Queensland education requirements	60
2.21.5 Managing diversity to ensure students will remain engaged with learning	61
2.22 Vocational subjects currently offered in Queensland schools	62
2.22.1 Hospitality studies as a subject providing trained employees for the accommodation, cafes and restaurant sector	62
2.22.2 Hospitality Practices.....	63
2.22.3 Hospitality Studies.....	64
2.22.4 Transition year for schools who teach Hospitality.....	66
2.23 Summation - The wide variations in vocational education occurring across the country are narrowing.....	66

CHAPTER THREE: PROCEDURES AND METHODS	70
3.1 Research Questions	70
3.2 Ensuring Validity	71
3.3 Project Design	73
3.4 Population/sample	73
3.5 Selection of methods for Data Collection	74
3.6 Data Gathering	75
3.7 Aims of the project	76
3.8 Extrapolation of results	76
CHAPTER FOUR: RESULTS	78
4.1: Schools and System	78
4.1.1 Identification of the Hospitality courses offered at Marymount College	79
4.2 Class time allocation for Hospitality	79
4.2.1 Analysis of time allocated for mandatory assessment criteria in the Marymount College Hospitality work programs	80
4.3 Analysis of the methods used to assess student achievement in Hospitality	81
4.4 The Student View	83
4.4.1 Student profile.....	84
4.4.2 Students' reasons for enrolling in Hospitality.....	84
4.4.3 Advice given to students about career & subject choice before choosing to study Hospitality	85
4.4.4 Student suggestions for improvement in current subject selection information procedures.....	86
4.4.5 Relevance of Hospitality to the students perceived future career.....	87
4.4.6 Paid employment rate of Hospitality students at Marymount College.....	88
4.4.7 The occupation areas Hospitality student respondents were engaging with in the paid workforce	89
4.4.8 Student respondents who are completing traineeships	89
4.4.9 Perceived value of Hospitality as a school offering	90
4.4.10 Student Perceptions - realistic perception by students of their grading in Hospitality	92
4.4.11 Student expectations of Hospitality	94
4.4.12 Student enjoyment of Hospitality.....	95
4.4.13 What students like about Hospitality	96
4.4.14 What students dislike about Hospitality	98
4.4.15 Currency and responsiveness	98
4.4.16 The teaching of Generic Key Competencies	103
4.4.17 Student learning	104
4.4.18 What students find easy to learn and difficult to learn in Hospitality	105
4.4.19 How well students understand what they have been shown in practical demonstrations.....	106

4.4.20 Student ownership of their learning.....	106
4.4.21 The ways in which students learn.....	107
4.4.22 Analysis of current course materials, course organisation and assessment materials to observe whether these provide for the ways that students learn.....	108
4.4.23 How to improve assessment in Hospitality	109
4.4.24 Improving student learning.....	109
4.4.25 Student perception of what makes a good vocational teacher	110
4.4.26 Induction program at the commencement of the course	111
4.5 Student Interviews	111
4.5.1 Currency and responsiveness of current course.....	112
4.5.2 Teacher views – interview data	113
4.6 Industry Results	119
4.6.1 Skills and attributes considered essential by the hospitality workplace for trainees.	119
4.6.2 Acquisition stages of required skills	121
4.6.3 Industry-identified skills and attributes with Units of Competency for Hospitality Practices (Kitchen Operations).....	124
4.6.4 Industry-identified skills and attributes with Units of Competency for Hospitality Studies (Operations).....	125
4.6.5 Comparison of industry-identified skills and attributes with Units of Competency	127
4.6.6 Industry response to Generic Key Competencies.....	128
CHAPTER FIVE: DISCUSSION OF FINDINGS	130
5.1 School and system - Results of desk-top audit of course plan and assessment items	130
5.1.1 Analysis of the class time allocation spent on each of the required criteria, and comparison with the recommendation of the Queensland Studies Authority, and the requirement of Competency-Based Education.....	131
5.1.2 The opportunities for assessment provided to students.	134
5.1.3 Analysis of the range of competencies covered in the sample assessment instruments used in 2004.....	134
5.1.4 Modes of expression	135
5.1.5 Modelling and scaffolding for student responses.....	135
5.1.6 Resourcing requirements: Human resources	136
5.1.7 Physical resources	137
5.2. Discussion of student results	137
5.2.1 Student Profile	137
5.2.2 Students' reasons for enrolling in Hospitality.....	138
5.2.3 Career choices made by Hospitality students.....	140
5.2.4 The number of students studying Hospitality at school who have part-time jobs	140
5.2.5 The occupation areas in which Hospitality student respondents were engaging within the paid workforce	141

5.2.6 Student respondents who are completing traineeships	141
5.2.7 Perceived value of Hospitality as a school offering	142
5.2.8 Student Perceptions - Realistic perception by students of their grading in Hospitality	143
5.2.9 Student expectation of Hospitality	144
5.2.10 What students enjoyed about Hospitality.....	144
5.2.11 What students disliked about Hospitality.....	145
5.2.12 The currency and responsiveness of Hospitality course	146
5.2.13 The teaching of Generic Key Competencies	147
5.3 Student learning.....	148
5.3.1 What students find easy and difficult to learn in Hospitality.....	148
5.3.2 How well students understand what they have been shown in practical demonstrations.....	149
5.3.3 Student ownership of their learning.....	150
5.3.4 Identifying the ways in which students learn	150
5.3.5 Analysis of current course materials, course organisations and assessment materials to observe whether they provide for the ways in which students learn	151
5.3.6 Improving student learning.....	152
5.3.7 Student perception of what makes a good vocational teacher	153
5.3.8 Induction program at the commencement of the course.....	153
5.4 Discussion of the results of the student interviews	154
5.4.1 Student perception of Hospitality	154
5.4.2 The difficulties of teaching workplace competencies within a school environment.....	154
5.5 Discussion of results of the Teacher interviews	156
5.5.1 Staffing and teacher qualifications to deliver Vocational Education and Training.....	156
5.5.2 School and administrative issues: Up-Skilling in planning and assessment for vocational education	158
5.5.3 Consistency in teacher judgement.....	158
5.5.4 Time issues	158
5.6 Discussion of Industry Response	159
5.6.1 Skills and attributes considered essential by the hospitality workplace for trainees	159
5.6.2 Skills and attributes considered essential by the hospitality kitchen for trainees	160
5.6.3 Acquisition stages of required skill.....	161
5.6.4 Skills and attributes considered essential by hospitality for front of house trainees	162
5.6.5 Industry satisfaction with current levels of achievements and skills.....	162
5.6.6 Developing Generic Key Competencies	165
5.6.7 The importance of specific skills – comparison of industry and student results	166
5.6.8 Identifying how well students have learned these tasks in Hospitality.....	167
5.6.9 School requirements from industry to improve current courses	168
CHAPTER SIX: SUMMARY.....	169
References.....	175

GLOSSARY

Title	Acronym	Description
Vocational Education and Training	VET	Post-compulsory education and training, excluding degree and higher level programs delivered by higher education institutions, which provide people with occupational or work-related knowledge and skills.
National Training Framework	NTF	The component parts of the vocational education and training system – national competency standards, national qualifications and national assessment guidelines – and their relationship to each other including implementation, quality assurance and recognition strategies and procedures. Endorsed training packages provide the implementation tools.
Australian National Training Authority	ANTA	A commonwealth statutory authority with responsibilities for the development of national policy, goals and objectives for the vocational education and training sector; the development, management and promotion of the National Training Framework; administration and funding of national programs; and the collection and analysis of national statistical data on the vocational education and training system.
Australian Qualifications Framework	AQF	A nationally consistent set of qualifications for all post-compulsory education and training in Australia
Industry Training Advisory Board	ITABS	An organization, usually an incorporated association of company, recognised as representing a particular industry and providing advice to government on the vocational education and training needs of its particular industry. These are both national and state and Territory industry training advisory bodies
Australian Recognition Framework	ARF	A set of nationally agreed registration requirements for training providers, their products and services.
Training Package		An integrated set of nationally endorsed standards and qualifications for training, assessing and recognising peoples skills, developed by industry to meet the training needs of and industry or group of industries. Training packages consist of core endorsed components of competency standards, assessment guidelines and qualifications, and optional non-endorsed components of support materials such as learning strategies, assessment resources and professional development materials
The New Apprenticeship System		An umbrella term for the new national apprenticeship and traineeship arrangement that came into effect on 1 January 1998.

VET-in-Schools program	(In full Vocational Education and Training in Schools) a program, which allows students to combine vocational, studies with their general education curriculum. Students participating in VET in Schools continue to work towards their Senior Secondary School Certificate, while the VET component of their studies gives them credit towards a nationally recognised VET qualification.
------------------------	--