Fitness for Trial Among Juvenile Offenders in Queensland

Jodie O’Leary  
Bond University, jooleary@bond.edu.au

Suzie O’Toole  
Bond University, Suzanne_O’Toole@bond.edu.au

Bruce Watt  
Bond University, bruce_watt@bond.edu.au

Kathleen Reynolds  
Bond University

Rachael Hinton  
Bond University

Follow this and additional works at: http://epublications.bond.edu.au/research_posters

Part of the Criminal Law Commons, Human Rights Law Commons, and the Juvenile Law Commons

Recommended Citation  
O’Leary, Jodie; O’Toole, Suzie; Watt, Bruce; Reynolds, Kathleen; and Hinton, Rachael, "Fitness for Trial Among Juvenile Offenders in Queensland" (2013). Research Week Posters. 27.  

This Book is brought to you by the Research Week at ePublications@bond. It has been accepted for inclusion in Research Week Posters by an authorized administrator of ePublications@bond. For more information, please contact Bond University’s Repository Coordinator.
Fitness For Trial Among Juvenile Offenders In Queensland

Many adults … have considerable difficulties in dealing with legal processes. However, these difficulties are significantly magnified for children.


Project Hypothesis

Queensland laws and/or processes do not adequately protect juveniles who may be unfit to stand trial due to mental illness, cognitive impairment or immaturity.

Background

To be fit to stand trial the accused must be able to instruct counsel. This requires the ability to understand the charge, follow the proceedings, understand the substantial effect of the evidence against them, and answer the charge. (R v Presser [1958] VR 45; see also Mental Health Act 2000 (Qld) Schedule).

QLD law regarding unfitness is the same for adults and children. But are juvenile offenders further disadvantaged in their ability to understand proceedings because of their youth?

Aims

This project focuses on current law and practice in Queensland to examine whether enough is being done to ensure that juveniles who may lack fitness are identified, assessed and diverted (where appropriate) from the criminal justice system.

Methodology

- Obtain and analyse Mental Health Court (Qld) data
- Survey legal practitioners, youth justice workers, psychiatrists and psychologists
- Obtain and analyse data from Legal Aid Queensland

Preliminary Findings

Juveniles are only half as likely to be referred to the MHC and to be found unfit to stand trial in QLD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Defendants in Qld 2006 - 2011</th>
<th>Referrals to MHC 2006 - 2011</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Defendants found unfit</td>
<td>5.33%</td>
<td>2.86%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Juveniles</td>
<td>0.0073%</td>
<td>0.0152%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adults</td>
<td>94.67%</td>
<td>97.14%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Potential Reasons For Low Rate of Juvenile Referrals to MHC

- Problems related to identification (by lawyers)
- Problems related to determination (by psychologists)
- Confusion related to the legal test
- Other procedural barriers

Investigators: Jodie O’Leary (Law), Suzie O’Toole (Law) and Dr Bruce Watt (HSS).
Research Assistants: Kathleen Reynolds (Law) and Rachael Hinton (HSS).