

A Critical Analysis of the Teaching of Hospitality at  
Marymount College

G. Y. Jenkins

Bond University

Gold Coast

Australia

SEPTEMBER 2005

## ABSTRACT

<b>CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION .....</b>	<b>9</b>
1.1 Growth of vocational education in schools.....	9
1.2 The need for effective reflective practices in vocational education .....	10
1.3 Background to the project .....	10
<b>CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW .....</b>	<b>12</b>
2.1 The premise of education and learning.....	12
2.2 Providing expanded pathways for high school students .....	12
2.3 Changing educational expectations .....	13
2.4 Workplace learning in the school .....	13
2.5 Historical background of vocational education – International Perspective .....	14
2.5.1 Overview of the origins of teaching workplace skills in formal education.....	14
2.5.2 Economic Rationalism and its relationship with education.....	14
2.5.3 Internationally-recognised vocational models of learning.....	16
2.5.4 The development of Competency-Based Education and Training in America .....	16
2.5.5 Researchers accredited with the foundations for Competency-Based Education and Training.....	17
2.5.6 Competency-Based Education and Training today in America currently.....	18
2.5.7 Assessment in Competency-Based Education and Training .....	18
2.5.8 Features of Competency-Based Education and Training.....	19
2.5.9 Ascertaining competency.....	19
2.5.10 Characteristics of the American model of vocational training .....	20
2.5.11 Critics of the American model.....	20
2.5.12 The Great Britain model of vocational training .....	21
2.5.13 The third model of vocational training – The Nordic Model .....	21
2.5.14 Outlier models of vocational training .....	22
2.5.15 The relevance of the German and Japanese models of vocational training .....	23
2.6 The development of Vocational Education in Australia .....	24
2.6.1 The beginnings of the Vocational Training movement in Australia.....	24
2.6.2 Education in Queensland .....	25
2.6.3 Vocational education in Queensland prior to 1890 .....	25
2.6.4 The beginnings of formalised vocational education in Queensland.....	26
2.6.5 The beginnings of a national vocational education scheme – The Kangan Report .....	28
2.6.6 The development of secondary education in Queensland.....	28
2.6.7 The merging of secondary education and vocational education at a national level.....	29
2.6.8 Significant reports influencing the national vocational education agenda .....	30
2.6.9 The introduction of Competency Based Education and Training into Australian vocational training.....	31
2.7 National Competency Standards for Vocational Education .....	32

2.8 Changes to vocational training during the 1990s .....	32
2.9 The Generic Key Competencies .....	33
2.9.1 The Australian Generic Key competencies as identified by the Mayer report.....	34
2.9.2 The development of the Generic Key Competency skills at a school level.....	36
2.10 The national focus for vocational training.....	38
2.11 The development of Training packages and implications on school .....	41
2.12 Identifying competency in the Training Packages .....	43
2.13 The development of a learning culture: The Australian Recognition Framework (ARF) and the New Apprenticeship System .....	43
2.14 The Common and Agreed National Goals for Schooling in the Twenty-first Century (The Adelaide Declaration) .....	44
2.15 The changing perception of vocational education .....	47
2.16 The growth of Vocational Education and Training in schools .....	48
2.17 The changing focus of the school curriculum .....	48
2.18 The advantages of incorporating VET into the school program .....	49
2.19 The issues associated with the growth of vocational education in schools .....	49
2.19.1 School programming, timetabling and staffing.....	50
2.19.2 The responses of students to workload demands .....	50
2.19.3 The effect on all teachers.....	51
2.19.4 The pedagogy of Competency-Based Education and Training.....	53
2.19.5 Changes to assessment methods .....	55
2.19.6 Industry acceptance and perception of school delivered vocational competency .....	56
2.20 Current implications of vocational education in schools .....	56
2.21 Local Policy considerations - Queensland Studies Authority Guidelines .....	57
2.21.1 The need to ensure more young people achieve higher qualifications.....	58
2.21.2 Queensland's response to this need.....	58
2.21.3 Current changes required in Queensland schools .....	60
2.21.4 Essential considerations associated with the implementation of the Queensland education requirements .....	60
2.21.5 Managing diversity to ensure students will remain engaged with learning .....	61
2.22 Vocational subjects currently offered in Queensland schools .....	62
2.22.1 Hospitality studies as a subject providing trained employees for the accommodation, cafes and restaurant sector .....	62
2.22.2 Hospitality Practices.....	63
2.22.3 Hospitality Studies.....	64
2.22.4 Transition year for schools who teach Hospitality.....	66
2.23 Summation - The wide variations in vocational education occurring across the country are narrowing.....	66

<b>CHAPTER THREE: PROCEDURES AND METHODS .....</b>	<b>70</b>
3.1 Research Questions .....	70
3.2 Ensuring Validity .....	71
3.3 Project Design .....	73
3.4 Population/sample .....	73
3.5 Selection of methods for Data Collection .....	74
3.6 Data Gathering .....	75
3.7 Aims of the project .....	76
3.8 Extrapolation of results .....	76
<b>CHAPTER FOUR: RESULTS .....</b>	<b>78</b>
4.1: Schools and System .....	78
4.1.1 Identification of the Hospitality courses offered at Marymount College .....	79
4.2 Class time allocation for Hospitality .....	79
4.2.1 Analysis of time allocated for mandatory assessment criteria in the Marymount College Hospitality work programs .....	80
4.3 Analysis of the methods used to assess student achievement in Hospitality .....	81
4.4 The Student View .....	83
4.4.1 Student profile.....	84
4.4.2 Students' reasons for enrolling in Hospitality.....	84
4.4.3 Advice given to students about career & subject choice before choosing to study Hospitality	85
4.4.4 Student suggestions for improvement in current subject selection information procedures.....	86
4.4.5 Relevance of Hospitality to the students perceived future career.....	87
4.4.6 Paid employment rate of Hospitality students at Marymount College.....	88
4.4.7 The occupation areas Hospitality student respondents were engaging with in the paid workforce .....	89
4.4.8 Student respondents who are completing traineeships .....	89
4.4.9 Perceived value of Hospitality as a school offering .....	90
4.4.10 Student Perceptions - realistic perception by students of their grading in Hospitality .....	92
4.4.11 Student expectations of Hospitality .....	94
4.4.12 Student enjoyment of Hospitality.....	95
4.4.13 What students like about Hospitality .....	96
4.4.14 What students dislike about Hospitality .....	98
4.4.15 Currency and responsiveness .....	98
4.4.16 The teaching of Generic Key Competencies .....	103
4.4.17 Student learning .....	104
4.4.18 What students find easy to learn and difficult to learn in Hospitality .....	105
4.4.19 How well students understand what they have been shown in practical demonstrations.....	106

4.4.20 Student ownership of their learning.....	106
4.4.21 The ways in which students learn.....	107
4.4.22 Analysis of current course materials, course organisation and assessment materials to observe whether these provide for the ways that students learn.....	108
4.4.23 How to improve assessment in Hospitality .....	109
4.4.24 Improving student learning.....	109
4.4.25 Student perception of what makes a good vocational teacher .....	110
4.4.26 Induction program at the commencement of the course .....	111
4.5 Student Interviews .....	111
4.5.1 Currency and responsiveness of current course.....	112
4.5.2 Teacher views – interview data .....	113
4.6 Industry Results .....	119
4.6.1 Skills and attributes considered essential by the hospitality workplace for trainees. ....	119
4.6.2 Acquisition stages of required skills .....	121
4.6.3 Industry-identified skills and attributes with Units of Competency for Hospitality Practices (Kitchen Operations).....	124
4.6.4 Industry-identified skills and attributes with Units of Competency for Hospitality Studies (Operations).....	125
4.6.5 Comparison of industry-identified skills and attributes with Units of Competency .....	127
4.6.6 Industry response to Generic Key Competencies.....	128
<b>CHAPTER FIVE: DISCUSSION OF FINDINGS .....</b>	<b>130</b>
5.1 School and system - Results of desk-top audit of course plan and assessment items .....	130
5.1.1 Analysis of the class time allocation spent on each of the required criteria, and comparison with the recommendation of the Queensland Studies Authority, and the requirement of Competency-Based Education.....	131
5.1.2 The opportunities for assessment provided to students. ....	134
5.1.3 Analysis of the range of competencies covered in the sample assessment instruments used in 2004.....	134
5.1.4 Modes of expression .....	135
5.1.5 Modelling and scaffolding for student responses.....	135
5.1.6 Resourcing requirements: Human resources .....	136
5.1.7 Physical resources .....	137
5.2. Discussion of student results .....	137
5.2.1 Student Profile .....	137
5.2.2 Students' reasons for enrolling in Hospitality.....	138
5.2.3 Career choices made by Hospitality students.....	140
5.2.4 The number of students studying Hospitality at school who have part-time jobs .....	140
5.2.5 The occupation areas in which Hospitality student respondents were engaging within the paid workforce .....	141

5.2.6 Student respondents who are completing traineeships .....	141
5.2.7 Perceived value of Hospitality as a school offering .....	142
5.2.8 Student Perceptions - Realistic perception by students of their grading in Hospitality .....	143
5.2.9 Student expectation of Hospitality .....	144
5.2.10 What students enjoyed about Hospitality.....	144
5.2.11 What students disliked about Hospitality.....	145
5.2.12 The currency and responsiveness of Hospitality course .....	146
5.2.13 The teaching of Generic Key Competencies .....	147
5.3 Student learning.....	148
5.3.1 What students find easy and difficult to learn in Hospitality.....	148
5.3.2 How well students understand what they have been shown in practical demonstrations.....	149
5.3.3 Student ownership of their learning.....	150
5.3.4 Identifying the ways in which students learn .....	150
5.3.5 Analysis of current course materials, course organisations and assessment materials to observe whether they provide for the ways in which students learn .....	151
5.3.6 Improving student learning.....	152
5.3.7 Student perception of what makes a good vocational teacher .....	153
5.3.8 Induction program at the commencement of the course.....	153
5.4 Discussion of the results of the student interviews .....	154
5.4.1 Student perception of Hospitality .....	154
5.4.2 The difficulties of teaching workplace competencies within a school environment.....	154
5.5 Discussion of results of the Teacher interviews .....	156
5.5.1 Staffing and teacher qualifications to deliver Vocational Education and Training.....	156
5.5.2 School and administrative issues: Up-Skilling in planning and assessment for vocational education .....	158
5.5.3 Consistency in teacher judgement.....	158
5.5.4 Time issues .....	158
5.6 Discussion of Industry Response .....	159
5.6.1 Skills and attributes considered essential by the hospitality workplace for trainees .....	159
5.6.2 Skills and attributes considered essential by the hospitality kitchen for trainees .....	160
5.6.3 Acquisition stages of required skill.....	161
5.6.4 Skills and attributes considered essential by hospitality for front of house trainees .....	162
5.6.5 Industry satisfaction with current levels of achievements and skills.....	162
5.6.6 Developing Generic Key Competencies .....	165
5.6.7 The importance of specific skills – comparison of industry and student results .....	166
5.6.8 Identifying how well students have learned these tasks in Hospitality.....	167
5.6.9 School requirements from industry to improve current courses .....	168
<b>CHAPTER SIX: SUMMARY.....</b>	<b>169</b>
<b>References.....</b>	<b>175</b>

## GLOSSARY

Title	Acronym	Description
Vocational Education and Training	VET	Post-compulsory education and training, excluding degree and higher level programs delivered by higher education institutions, which provide people with occupational or work-related knowledge and skills.
National Training Framework	NTF	The component parts of the vocational education and training system – national competency standards, national qualifications and national assessment guidelines – and their relationship to each other including implementation, quality assurance and recognition strategies and procedures. Endorsed training packages provide the implementation tools.
Australian National Training Authority	ANTA	A commonwealth statutory authority with responsibilities for the development of national policy, goals and objectives for the vocational education and training sector; the development, management and promotion of the National Training Framework; administration and funding of national programs; and the collection and analysis of national statistical data on the vocational education and training system.
Australian Qualifications Framework	AQF	A nationally consistent set of qualifications for all post-compulsory education and training in Australia
Industry Training Advisory Board	ITABS	An organization, usually an incorporated association of company, recognised as representing a particular industry and providing advice to government on the vocational education and training needs of its particular industry. These are both national and state and Territory industry training advisory bodies
Australian Recognition Framework	ARF	A set of nationally agreed registration requirements for training providers, their products and services.
Training Package		An integrated set of nationally endorsed standards and qualifications for training, assessing and recognising peoples skills, developed by industry to meet the training needs of and industry or group of industries. Training packages consist of core endorsed components of competency standards, assessment guidelines and qualifications, and optional non-endorsed components of support materials such as learning strategies, assessment resources and professional development materials
The New Apprenticeship System		An umbrella term for the new national apprenticeship and traineeship arrangement that came into effect on 1 January 1998.

VET-in-Schools program	(In full Vocational Education and Training in Schools) a program, which allows students to combine vocational, studies with their general education curriculum. Students participating in VET in Schools continue to work towards their Senior Secondary School Certificate, while the VET component of their studies gives them credit towards a nationally recognised VET qualification.
------------------------	--